

BEFORE THE JUDICIAL PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

MDL DOCKET NO. 1657

IN RE: VIOXX PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

TO: **VIA OVERNIGHT DELIVERY:**

> MICHAEL J. BECK, CLERK OF THE PANEL ONE COLUMBUS CIRCLE N.E.

THURGOOD MARSHALL FEDERAL JUDICIARY BUILDING **ROOM G-255 NORTH LOBBY**

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20002-8004

T. Rawdon Beaty v. Merck & Co., et al., M.D. Alabama, C.A. No. 2:05-cv-880-T (formerly No. 2:05-cv-880-W)

NOTICE OF OPPOSITION TO CONDITIONAL TRANSFER ORDER

Plaintiff, by and through undersigned counsel, hereby files his Notice of Opposition to the Conditional Transfer Order (CTO-26) dated October 6, 2005 on the following grounds:

- 1. Jurisdiction and venue of this matter are proper in the Circuit Court of Barbour County, Alabama.
 - 2. The Defendants' Notice of Removal is improper.
- 3. The Defendants' ground for removal, namely, that there was fraudulent joinder, is incorrect. All of the relief sought by the Plaintiff in his complaint is properly founded upon state law claims.

- 4. This case is not properly removable under 28 U.S.C. § 1441. No federal court has subject matter jurisdiction over this non-diversity case originally filed in the Circuit Court of Barbour County, Alabama.
- 5. Plaintiff has filed a Motion to Remand with supporting brief which is currently before the United States District Court for the Middle District of Alabama, Northern Division.
- 6. Transfer is inappropriate because federal subject matter jurisdiction does not exist.
- 7. Transfer is inappropriate because this case involves only Alabama state law claims.
- 8. Transfer is inappropriate because common issues do not predominate over individual issues of fact.
 - 9. Transfer will not advance the just and efficient conduct of this case.
- 10. Transfer is inappropriate because this case is not sufficiently complex and time consuming.
- 11. Transfer of this case will not further the convenience of the parties and witnesses in this case.
- 12. Transfer to the MDL will place a great burden upon the Plaintiff and other parties and witnesses to this case.

Respectfully submitted this W

day of October, 2005.

ANDY D. BIRCHFIEL
J. PAUL SIZEMORE

Attorneys for Plaintiff

OF COUNSEL:

BEASLEY, ALLEN, CROW, METHVIN, PORTIS & MILES, P.C. Post Office Box 4160 Montgomery, AL 36103 Telephone: (334)269-2343

Telephone: (334)269-2343 Facsimile: (334)954-7555

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

F COUNSEL

Americsourcebergen 1300 Mortis Drive Suite 100 Chesterbrook, PA 19087

Matthew H. Armstrong Marker & Armstrong, LLC One Metropolitan Square Suite 2970 St. Louis, MO 63102-2793

Bryan F. Aylstock Aylstock, Witkin & Sasser, P.L.C. 55 Baybridge Drive Gulf Breeze, FL 32561

Timothy R. Balducci
The Langston Law Firm, P.A.
100 South Main Street
P.O. Box 787
Booneville, MS 38829-0787

Steven C. Barkley 3560 Delaware Suite 305 Beaumont, TX 77706 T. Scott Allen, Jr.
Cruse, Scott, Henderson & Allen
2777 Allen Parkway
7th Floor
Houston, TX 77019

Dario Arango, M.D. 5407 South McColl Road Suite B Edinburg, TX 78539

Richard J. Arsenault Neblett Beard & Arsenault P.O. Box 1190 Alexandria, LA 71309-1190

> Blake H. Bailey Bailey Law Firm 112 South Broadway Tyler, TX 75702

David A. Barrett
Boies, Schiller & Flexner, LLP
570 Lexington Avenue
16th Floor
New York, NY 10022

Bradley Douglas Becnel Law Offices Of Daniel E. Becnel, Jr. 425 W. Airline Hwy. Suite B Laplace, LA 70068

> Bergen Brunswig P.O. Box 959 Valley Forge, PA 19482

Steve W. Berman Hagens, Berman, Sobol, Shapiro, L.L.P. 1301 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2900 Seattle, WA 98101

Andy Birchfield Beasley, Allen, Crow, Methvin, Portis & Miles P.O. Box 4160 234 Commerce Street Montgomery, AL 36103-4160

Ellis Bradford, Jr.
Prisoner #01A4242-27 East 21 Bed
Mid-State Correctional Facility
P.O. Box 2500
March, NY 13403

Virginia M. Buchanan Levin, Papantonio, Thomas, Mitchell, et al. 316 S. Baylen Street Suite 600 Pensacola, FL 32501-5996

Andrew J. Carboy Sullivan, Papain, Block, McGrath & Cannavo 120 Broadway 18th Floor New York, NY 10271

> Stephen W. Burrow Williams, Heidelberg, et al. P.O. Box 1407 711 Delmas Avenue Pascagoula, MS 39568-1407

Daniel E. Becnel, Jr.
Law Offices of Daniel E. Becnel, Jr.
106 West Seventh Street
P.O. Drawer H
Reserve, LA 70084-2095

C. William Berger Furr & Cohen One Boca Place 2255 Glades Road Suite 337W Boca Raton, FL 33431

Reshonda L. Bradford Singleton Law Office 4050 Linwood Avenue Shreveport, LA 71108

Joseph M. Bruno Bruno & Bruno, LLP 855 Baronne Street New Orleans, LA 70113

Elizabeth J. Cabraser
Lieff, Cabraser, Heimann & Berstein, LLP
Embarcadero Center West
275 Battery Street
30th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111-3339

Robert Carey Stephanie Lynn Bozzo Hagens, Berman, Sobol, Shapiro, L.L.P. 2425 East Camelback Road, Suite 650 Phoenix, AZ 85016-4214

Raymond S. Carroll Law Offices of Weiner, Carroll & Strauss 119 Rockland Center Suite 425 Nanuet, NY 10954

John R. Climaco, John A. Peca, Terri A. Lightner, Dawn M.
Chmielewski
Climaco, Lefkowitz, Peca, Wilcox & Garofoli
1228 Euclid Avenue
Suite 900
Cleveland, OH 44115

C. York Craig, Jr. Craig, Hester, Luke & Dodson P.O. Box 12005 Jackson, MS 39236-2005

John Michael D'Amato, Jr. Russo, Scamardella & D'Amato, P.C. 1010 Forest Avenue Staten Island, NY 10310

Eric C. Deters Eric C. Deters & Associates, P.S.C. 5247 Madison Pike Independence, KY 41051

> John Driscoll Brown & Crouppen 720 Olive Street Suite 1800 St. Louis, MO 63101-2302

Daniel A. Edelman Edelman, Combs & Latturner, LLC 120 South LaSalle Street 18th Floor Chicago, IL 60603

> James A. Edwards Cantey & Hanger 801 Cherry Street Suite 2100 Burnett Plaza Fort Worth, TX 76102

Reginald K. Fears James H. Byrd Unit 21 FM 247 Huntsville, TX 77320

R. Allen Flowers Flowers Law Firm 341 North 25th Avenue Hattiesburg, MS 39401

Ernest Cory Cory, Watson, Crowder & DeGaris, P.C. 2131 Magnolia Avenue Suite 200 Birmingham, AL 35205

Hubert A. Crouch, III and Kim M. Meaders Crouch & Ramey, L.L.P. 1445 Ross Avenue, Sutie 2300 Dallas, TX 75202

Richard E. Crum Cobb, Shealy, Crum & Derrick, P.A. P.O. Box 6346 Dothan, AL 36302-6346

Elizabeth A. Fegan Timothy A. Scott Hagens, Berman, Sobol, Shapiro, L.L.P. 60 W. Randolph, Suite 200 Chicago, IL 60601

> Dana Foster, P.A. 2731 Brook Bend Land El Campo, TX 77437

Ivan Dixon 8413 Edgewood Drive Rowlett, TX 75089

John P. Eberhardt # 1083045 1100 FM 655 Rosharon, TX 77583

Richard M. Edmonson Armstrong Allen, PLLC 4450 Old Canton Road Suite 210 Jackson, MS 39211

Dana Casselli Fox Waters & Kraus 3219 McKinney Avenue Suite 3000 Dallas, TX 75204

Michael T. Gallagher Gallagher Law Firm, P.C. 777 Walker Street Suite 2500 Houston, TX 77002

> Ricardo A. Garcia 820 S. Main Street McAllen, TX 78501

Ronald S. Goldser Zimmerman Reed, P.L.L.P. 651 Nicollet Mall Suite 501 Minneapolis, MN 55402-4123

C. Anthony Graffeo
Watson, Jimmerson, Givhan, et al.
203 Greene Street
P.O. Box 18368
Huntsville, AL 35804

Patricia Griffith 1045 Evelyn Avenue Clarksdale, MS 38614

Lance A. Harke Harke & Clasby 155 South Miami Avenue Suite 600 Miami, FL 33130

Craig D. Hebderson Gary, Thomasson, Hall & Mark Professional Corp P.O. Box 2888 210 S. Carancahua Corpus Christi, TX 78403 Calvin C. Fayard, Jr. Fayard & Honeycutt 519 Florida Avenue, S.W. Denham Springs, LA 70726

William B. Federman Federman & Sherwood 120 North Robinson Avenue Suite 2720 Oklahoma City, OK 73102

Shawn G. Foster Davis, Bethune & Jones, LLC 1100 Main Street Suite 2390 Kansas City, MO 64105

Richard A. Freese Sweet & Freese, P.L.L.C P.O. Box 1178 Jackson, MS 39215

Hector G. Gancedo Gancedo & Nieves 144 West Colorado Blvd. Pasadena, CA 91105

Mary Gibson P.O. Box 400 St. Mary's, GA 31558

Andrew S. Goldwasser Ciano & Goldwasser 460 MK Ferguson Plaza 1500 West Third Street Suite 460 Cleveland, OH 44113

Tim T. Griesenbeck Plunkett & Gibson Renaissance Plaza, Suite 1100 70 N.E. Loop 410 P.O. Box 795061 San Antonio, TX 78216 Robert M. Hodges Wise, Carter, Child & Caraway P.O. Box 651 Jackson, MS 39205-0651

John F. Hughes Hamilton Law Firm P.O. Box 1511 Meridian, MS 39302-1511

> Mark B. Hutton Hutton & Hutton P.O. Box 638 Wichita, KS 67201

Dennis J. Johnson Johnson & Perkinson 1690 Williston Road P.O. Box 2305 S. Burlington, VT 05403

Whitman B. Johnson, III Currie, Johnson, Griffin, Gaines & Myers P.O. Box 750 Jackson, MS 39205-0750

Allan Kanner
Elizabeth B. Cowen
Mary Elizabeth Gardner
Allan Kanner & Associates, P.L.L.C.
701 Camp Street
New Orleans, LA 70130

R. Eric Kennedy Weisman, Kennedy & Berris 1600 Midland Building 101 Prospect Avenue, West Cleveland, OH 44115

Timothy M. Kolman
Timothy M. Kolman And Associates
255 North Flowers Mill Road
The Shoppes at Flowers Mill
Langhorne, PA 19047

Jeffrey D. Guerriero Guerriero & Guerriero P.O. Box 4092 Monroe, LA 71211-4092

Jennifer Haskins
Assistant General Counsel
Tort Litigation Division, Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
702 S.W. 8th Street
Bentonville, AR 72716-0215

David Hadden Hockema Hockema, Tippit & Escobedo, L.L.P. 1 Paseo Del Prado Bldg. 101 P.O. Box 720540 McAllen, TX 78504-0540

Jesse L. Howell, III Copeland, Cook, Taylor & Bush, P.A. 200 Concourse, Suite 200 1062 Highland Colony Parkway P.O. Box 6020 Ridgeland, MS 39158-6020

> Debra L. Hurst Hurst & Hurst 401 West "A" Street Suite 1825 San Diego, CA 92101

Walter T. Johnson Watkins & Eager The Emporium Building 400 East Capitol Street Suite 300 P.O. Box 650 Jackson, MS 39205-0650

Christy D. Jones Butler, Snow, O'Mara, Stevens & Cannada P.O. Box 22567 Jackson, MS 39225-2567

> Brian S. Kabateck Kabateck, Brown, Kellner 350 S. Grand Avenue 39th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071

W. Mark Lanier Lanier Law Firm 6810 FM 1960 West Houston, TX 77069

Ira H. Leesfield Leesfield, Leighton, Rubio & Mahfood, P.A. 2350 South Dixic Highway Miami, FL 33133

> Carlene Rhodes Lewis Goforth, Lewis, Sanford, LLP 1111 Bagby Suite 2200 Houston, TX 77002

Richard A. Lockridge Lockridge, Grindal & Nauen P.L.L.P 100 Washington Avenue South Suite 2200 Minneapolis, MN 55401-2179

Patrick A. Malone Stein, Mitchell & Mezines 1100 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Suite 1100 Washington, DC 20036

Kenneth B. McClain Humphrey, Farrington & McClain, P.C. 221 West Lexington Suite 400 Independence, MO 64050

Joseph L. McNamara Copeland, Cook, Taylor & Bush, P.A. 200 Concourse, Suite 200 1062 Highland Colony Parkway P.O. Box 6020 Ridgeland, MS 39158-6020

S. Kirk Milam Hickman, Goza & Spragins, PLLC P.O. Drawer 668 Oxford, MS 38655-0668 David A. Hylla Bibrey & Hylla 8724 Pin Oak Road P.O. Box 975 Edwardville, IL 62025

Norman C. Kleinberg Hughes Hubbard & Reed LLP One Battery Park Plaza New York, NY 10004

Sharon L. Kegerreis Hughes, Hubbard & Reed, LLP 201 S. Biscayne Boulevard Suite 2500 Miami, FL 33131-4332

Jeffrey D. Leathers Greer, Pipkin, Russell, Dent & Leathers P.O. Box 907 Tupelo, MS 38802

Arnold Levin Levin, Fishbein, Sedran &Berman 510 Walnut Street Suite 500 Philadelphia, PA 19106

David K. Lietz Coale, Cooley, Lietz, McInerny & Broadus 818 Connecticut Avenue Suite 857 Washington, DC 20006

> William O. Luckett, Jr. Luckett Law Firm P.O. Drawer 1000 Clarksdale, MS 38614-1000

David P. Matthews Abraham, Watkins, Nichols, Sorrels, et al. 800 Commerce Street Houston, TX 77002-1776 Mason L. Miller Getty & Mayo, PLLC 1900 Lexington Financial Center 250 W. Main Street Lexington, KY 40507

> Daniel Minor 1032 Cardinal Dr. Waco, TX 76712

Michael H. Moirano Nisen & Elliott 200 West Adams Street Suite 2500 Chicago, IL 60606

Geoffrey C. Mousseau Mousseau & Associates 1421 Valverde Place Suite B Glendale, CA 91208

John T. Murray Murray & Murray 111 East Shoreline Drive P.O. Box 19 Sandusky, OH 44871

Dianne M. Nast Roda & Nast, P.C. 801 Estelle Drive Lancaster, PA 17601

Richard F. O'Malley Sidley Austin Brown & Wood 10 South Dearborn Street Suite 48 Southeast Chicago, IL 60603

Thomas Jack Pearson Pearson & Campbell, P.C. 2394 Calder Avenue Beaumont, TX 77702 J. Leray McNamara
Copeland, Cook, Taylor & Bush, P.A.
200 Concourse, Suite 200
1062 Highland Colony Parkway
P.O. Box 6020
Ridgeland, MS 39158

Charles M. Merkel Merkel & Cocke P.O. Box 1388 Clarksdale, MS 38614-1388

Allen Scott Milavetz Milavetz Gallop & Milavetz 6500 France Avenue, South Edina, MN 55435

Michel F. Mills Perona, Langer, Beck, Lallande & Serbin 300 E. San Antonio Drive P.O. Box 7948 Long Beach, CA 90807

> Steven R. Minor Elliot Lawson & Minor, PC P.O. Box 8400 Bristol, VA 24203-8400

Kenneth B. Moll Kenneth B. Moll & Associates, Ltd. Three First National Plaza 50th Floor Chicago, IL 60602

> Edwin T. Mulhern Huwel & Mulhern 11 New Hyde Park Road Frank Square, NY 11010

Stephen B. Murray Murray Law Firm 909 Poydras Street Suite 2550 New Orleans, LA 70112-4000 Frank M. Pitre
Cotchett, Pitre, Simon & McCarthy
San Francisco Airport Office Center
Suite 200
840 Malclom Road
Burlingame, CA 94010

Henry J. Price Price, Waicukauski & Mellowitz The Hammond Block Building 301 Massachusetts Avenue Indianapolis, IN 46204

Ellen A. Presby Baron & Budd, P.C. 3102 Oak Lawn Avenue, 11th Floor Dallas, TX 75206-5141

William R. Robb Aleshire, Robb & Sevils, P.C. 901 St. Louis Street Suite 1600 Springfield, MO 65806

John H. Ruiz Law Office of John H. Ruiz 5040 N.W. 7th Street Suite 920 Miami, FL 33126

Stephen V. Saia Law Offices of Stephen V. Saia 70 Old Cart Path Lane Pembroke, MA 02359

Stuart E. Scott Spangenberg, Shibley & Liber, LLP 2400 National City Center 1900 East.9th Street Cleveland, OH 44114

> Norman E. Siegel Stueve Helder & Siegel 330 W 47th St Ste 250 Kansas City, MO 64112

Eugene R. Naylor Wise, Carter, Child & Caraway 600 Heritage Bldg. 401 East Capitol St. P.O. Box 651 Jackson, MS 39205-0651

Gregory J. Owen Owen, Patterson & Owen 23822 West Valencia Blvd. Suite 201 Valencia, CA 91355

> Robert E. Piper, Jr. Piper & Associates 624 Pierre Avenue P.O. Box 69 Shreveport, LA 71103

Leslie J. Bryan
Doffermyre, Shields, Canfield, Knowles & Devine
13555 Peachtree Street, N.E. Suite 1600
The Peachtree
Atlanta, GA 30309-3269

Eric M. Quetglas-Jordan Queglas Law Offices P.O. Box 16606 San Juan, PR 00908-6606

Jeffrey Robinson Robinson & Sheen, L.L.C. 215 South State Street Suite 960 Salt Lake City, Utah 84111

Robert D. Rowland 2227 South State Route 157 Edwardsville, IL 62025

Scott Rynecki Rubenstien & Rynecki 16 Court Street Suite 1717 Brooklyn, NY 11241 David Neil Smith Nix, Patterson & Roach, LLP 205 Linda Drive Dangerfield, TX 75638

Kathryn A. Snapka Snapka, Truman & Waterhouse, LLP 606 N. Carancahua, Suite 1511 P.O. Drawer 23017 Corpus Christi, TX 78403

C. York Craig, Jr.
Craig Hester Luke & Dodson, P.A.
404 Fontaine Place, Suite 101
P.O. Box 12005
Jackson, MS 39236-2005

Stephen G. Strauss Bryan Cave, L.L.P. One Metropolitan Square Suite 3600 211 N. Broadway St. Louis, MO 63102

Thomas M. Sobol Hugh McNeely Hagens, Berman, Sobol, Shapiro L.L.P. One Main Street, 4th Floor Cambridge, MA 02142

Casandra F. Thomas 514-C Woodrow Wilson Avenue Jackson, MS 39213

Josephine Trovini
Westchester County Attorneys Office
600 Michaelian Office Building
148 Martime Avenue
White Plains, NY 10601

Chris J. Walker Markow Walker, P.A. P.O. Box 13669 Jackson, MS 39236-3669 Robert A. Schwartz Bailey, Gaylen & Gold 18333 Egret Bay Boulevard Suite 120 Houston, Texas 77058

Paul R.M. Schwebel 5657 Rundle Court Indianapolis, IN 46220

Christopher A. Seeger Seeger Weiss, LLP One William Street 10th Floor New York, NY 10004-2502

Jeffrey B. Simon Waters & Kraus 3219 McKinney Avenue Suite 3000 Dallas, TX 75204

Shanin Specter Kline & Specter 1525 Locust Street 19th Street Philadelphia, PA 19102

John S. Steward Meyerkord and Steward 2525 South Brentwood Boulevard Suite 102 St. Louis, MO 63144

Robert G. Sullivan Sullivan, Papain, Block, McGrath & Cannavo 120 Broadway 18th Floor New York, NY 10271

Deborah M. Sulzer Gauthier, Houghtaling, Williams & Sulzer 3500 N. Hullen Street Metairie, LA 70002 Leila H. Watson Cory, Watson, Crowder & DeGaris, P.C. 2131 Magnolia Avenue Suite 200 Birmingham, AL 35205

Richard J. Weiner Law Offices of Richard J. Weiner, P.C. 119 Rockland Center Suite 425 Nanuet, NY 10954

> Jewell E. Welch, III Cunard Reis Law Firm 9214 Interline Avenue Baton Rouge, LA 70809

James L. Wright Mithoff & Jacks 1 Congress Plaza 111 Congress Avenue Suite 1010 Austin, TX 78701-0001

James John Zonas James J. Zonas, Attorney at Law 700-2nd Avenue, North Suite 102 Naples, FL 34102

Michael A. Ysasaga Johnson, Finkel, DeLuca & Kennedy 1221 Lamar Suite 1000 Houston, TX 77010 Christopher V. Tisi Ashcraft & Gerel 2000 L Street, NW Suite 400 Washington, DC 20036

Lawrence D. Wade, Jr.
Campbell, DeLong, Hagwood & Wade
P.O. Box 1856
Greenville, MS 38702-3669

Thomas E. Walker
Johnston, Barton, Proctor & Powell
2900 AmSouth/ Harbert Plaza
1901 6th Avenue North
Birmingham, AL 35203

Jennifer Fadal Weaver 1305 Fossel Ridge Trial Waco, TX 76712

Leslie Weisbord Morgan & Weisbord 11551 Forest Central Drive Suite 300 Dallas, TX 75243

John K. Weston Sacks, Weston, Smolinksy, Albert & Luber 510 Walnut Street Suite 400 Philadelphia, PA 19106